UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA

In re:

Case Number 04-43162-RJK

Felicia N. Brown,

Chapter 13 Case

Debtor.

NOTICE OF HEARING AND MOTION OBJECTING TO CONFIRMATION OF CHAPTER 13 PLAN

To: Felicia N. Brown, Apartment 2, 2825 Park Avenue, Minneapolis, MN 55407; Robert J. Everhart, Attorney at Law, 708 Cleveland Avenue Southwest, #101, Post Office Box 120534, New Brighton, MN 55112; Jasmine Z. Keller, Chapter 13 Trustee, Suite 310, 12 South Sixth Street, Minneapolis, MN 55402;

U.S. Trustee, 1015 U.S. Courthouse, 300 South Fourth Street, Minneapolis, MN 55415.

City-County Federal Credit Union (City-County), by the undersigned, moves the Court for the relief requested below and gives notice of hearing.

NOTICE OF HEARING

- The Court will hold a hearing on the below motion at 10:30 a.m., August 19,
 2004, at Courtroom 8 West, United States Courthouse, 300 South Fourth Street, Minneapolis,
 Minnesota 55401, or as soon thereafter as counsel can be heard.
- 2. Any response to this motion must be delivered and filed not later than August 16, 2004, which is three days before the time set for the hearing (exclusive of Saturdays, Sundays, and legal holidays), or served and filed by mail not later than August 10, 2004, which is seven days before the time set for the hearing (exclusive of Saturdays, Sundays, and legal holidays).

3. This Court has jurisdiction over this motion pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 157 and 1334. This is a core proceeding under 28 U.S.C. § 157(b)(2)(L). This motion is filed under Bankruptcy Rules 3020(b), 9013 and 9014 and under Local Bankruptcy Rules 3015-3, 3020-1, 3020-3 and 9013-2. This proceeding arises under 11 U.S.C. §§ 1322, 1324 and 1325. Debtor commenced this Chapter 13 case on June 4, 2004. The case is now pending in this Court.

MOTION

4. City-County Federal Credit Union objects to confirmation of the Chapter 13 plan of the debtor dated April 13, 2004, and moves for denial of confirmation of plan based upon the facts set forth below.

STATEMENT OF FACTS

- 5. City-County Federal Credit Union has a claim against the debtor on its account 809005-50 as of June 7, 2004, in the amount of \$9,490.82 plus \$1.34 interest per day thereafter, pursuant to a note and disclosure statement with security grant dated April 4, 2003, a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit 1.
- 6. City-County Federal Credit Union's claim against the debtor on its account 809005-50 is secured by a perfected security interest in a 1998 Isuzu Trooper, VIN JACDJ58X6W7914068, as shown by the lien card, a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit 2.
- 7. The 1998 Isuzu Trooper has a base June 2004 NADA retail book value of \$8,350.00, and the same model of a 1997 Isuzu Trooper has a base June 2004 NADA retail book

value of \$6,800.00, reflecting an average reduction in value of \$129.10 per month; the value of the vehicle is decreasing with the passage of time and with use.

- 8. Using the June NADA retail book value of \$8,350.00 and the contract interest rate of 5.25 percent, the monthly interest attributed to the collateral value is \$36.53.
 - 9. The collateral of City-County is valued by the debtor as \$6,925.00.
- 10. The Chapter 13 plan dated April 13, 2004, provides for no payments on the secured claim of City-County until after the eighth month of the plan, with initial payments in the amount of \$153.00, increasing in the 36th month of the plan to \$225.00.
- 11. The contract between the debtor and City-County calls for payments in the amount of \$205.00 per month.
 - 12. City-County does not accept the debtor's plan.
- 13. The debtor has not provided for adequate protection of City-County's property interest in the collateral.
- 14. That debtor has not paid installments on her vehicle for March 2004, and thereafter while she has continued to possess the secured property of City-County.
- 15. The debtor has not provided proof of insurance for the subject vehicle as required by the terms of her agreement.
- 16. If testimony is required, Terri Nagle or Patty Brache of City-County Federal Credit Union, 6010 Earle Brown Drive, Brooklyn Center, MN 55430, may testify.

WHEREFORE, City-County Federal Credit Union moves the Court for an order:

1. Denying confirmation of the Chapter 13 plan of the debtor dated April 13, 2004;

and

2. Granting any other relief the Court deems just and proper.

Dated: August 12, 2004.

/e/ Lee W. Mosher

Lee W. Mosher
Attorney License Number 7570X
Davern McLeod & Mosher LLP
Suite 150
7500 Olson Memorial Highway
Golden Valley, Minnesota 55427
Telephone 763-545-5600
Attorneys for City-County Federal Credit Union

08-12-2004 14:40

FROM-DAVERN MCLEOD & MOSHER LLP

NOTICE REGARDING DEBT OR LIEN.

THIS IS A COMMUNICATION FROM A DEBT COLLECTOR.

The amount of the debt or lien: 1.

Account 809005-50

as of June 7, 2004, City-County Federal Credit Union has a claim on account 809005-50 in the amount of \$9,490.82, plus interest in the amount of \$1.34 per day thereafter, plus attorney's fees. The account is due for payments in the amount of \$205.00 commencing March 8, 2004, and every month thereafter. The account is past due as of June 7, 2004, in the amount of \$615.00.

- The name of the creditor to whom the debt/lien is owed: City-County Federal Credit 2. Union.
- Unless you, within 30 days after receipt of this notice, dispute the validity of the debt/lien, or any portion thereof, the debt/lien will be assumed to be valid by the undersigned. 3.
- If you notify the undersigned in writing within the 30 day period that the debt/lien, or any portion thereof, is disputed, the undersigned will obtain verification of the debt/lien or a 4. copy of a judgment against you and a copy of such verification or judgment will be mailed to you by the undersigned.
- Upon your written request within the 30 day period, the undersigned will provide you with the name and address of the original creditor, if different from the current creditor. 5.
- Any information obtained will be used for the purpose of attempting to collect the 6. debt/enforce or foreclose the lien.

THE RIGHT TO VERIFICATION OF THE DEBT OR LIEN AND IDENTITY OF THE ORIGINAL CREDITOR WITHIN THE TIME PROVIDED BY LAW ARE NOT AFFECTED BY THIS ACTION.

VERIFICATION

I, Terri Nagle, Collections Representative of City-County Federal Credit Union, named in the foregoing Notice of Hearing and Motion, declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct according to the best of my knowledge, information and belief.

Dated: August 12 ____, 2004.

04/3/2/251652nohamotcop02.wpd

CITY-COUNTY FEDERAL CREDIT UNION

6010 Earle Brown Drive Brooklyn Center, MN 55430-2506



NOTE AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

| RROWER NAME (Last - First - Mic | | | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|----------------------------------|---|--|
| | ddle Initiel) AND ADE | DRESS (Street - City - State - Zip Code) | X FIXED | DATE | ACCOUNT NUMB | ER NOTE NUMBER |
| ELICIA N. BROWN | | | VARIABLE | 04/04/200 | | |
| 1830 HAYES ST NE #7 | | | X NEW LOAN | CONTRACT N | UMBER REFERENCE NUI | MBER MATURITY DATE |
| HINNEAPOLIS, MN 55418- | | | REFINANCE | 022-0325- | | 06/18/07 |
| this agreement "you" and anyone to whom the lecked below apply to this | credit union tra | each person who signs this a ansfers its rights under this a | greement. The "cred greement. The term | lit union" mea s on the follo | ns the credit union w wing pages are part | hose name appears above of this agreement. Boxe |
| RUTH IN LENDING D | DISCLOSURE | | | | | |
| NNUAL PERCENTAGE | RATE FIN | ANCE CHARGE Amou | unt Financed | Total of Pay | i | ment: If you pay off you will not have to pa |
| ne cost of your credit as a ye | | | i . nt of credit ed to you or on your | The umount you payments as s | have made all a pena cheduled, | alty. |
| 05.2500 % | | • | 48.26 | \$10,299.58 | е | means an estimate |
| the 3 Month Treasury B may change quarterly | Bill (Index) o in January, r \$10,000 at | te may increase during the ter changes. We will add a mar April, July and October. 8% for 60 months and the | gin of 1.5% for no Any interest rat | ew collatera ce increase | Witt leadte in a | targer amount due a |
| Number of Payn | nents Amou | nt of Payments | When Paymen | ts Are Due | Property Insurance: | You may obtain prope |
| our 50 ayment 1 | \$ \$ | 205.00 MONTHLY BEG. 49.58 | ······ , | 04/18/2003 | insurance from an acceptable to the cr insurance from the | yone you want that edit union. If you get credit union you will p |
| rill be: ecurity: Collateral sec ad/or deposits in the C | uring other lo | ans with the credit union v | vill also secure this being purchased; [| s loan. You a | \$ are giving a securit scribe) | y interest in your shar |
| | | | | | | |
| ate Charge: will be charged 5% o | of the payment | amount of 205.00 that is | more than 10 days | late. | | |
| Required Deposit: The | Annual Percer | ntage Rate does not take in | ito account your re | quired depos | sit, if Filing Fees | Non-Filling Insurar |
| nny. | | y additional information abo | aut nonnayment d | efault and a | \$ 9.00 ny required repaym | ent in full before the |
| See your contract docu scheduled date. | iments for any | / additional information abo | Jut Hompaymone, a | ordan, and a | .,,, | |
| TEMIZATION OF TH | IT ANKOLINT | ENANCED | | | | |
| TEMIZATION OF | | AMOUNT GIVEN | AMOUNT P | AID ON | | FINANCE \$ |
| MOUNT FINANCED OF \$ | \$9,248.26 | TO YOU DIRECTLY \$ 9,248. | 26 YOUR ACC | OUNT \$0.00 | To | 7 |
| ON YOUR BEHALF | 9 \$ | То То | \$ \$ | | To To | |
| NOTE AND SECURI | TY AGREEN | IENT | | - 1- E 2500 I | | |
| Interest: Interest will be of change as follows: The 3 Month Treasury will change quarterly | charged from th | his is a variable rate loan The ne date of this loan until you h changes. We will add a ma April, July and October. A | lave paid what you o | vyo unuon una | Agreement, the mes | d colleteral The rat |
| maturity. | | | | | | |
| Promise to Pay: You pro | mise to pay \$ \$ | ,248.26 to the credit uni | | | | |
| Promise to Pay: You promise to Pay: You promise to Pay: You promise for the promise of the promise of the promise to Pay: You | | • | ion plus interest on t | ne unpaid bala | nce at 5.2500 % pe | or year until what you ow |
| Collection Costs: | | 0,248.26 to the credit uni | ion plus interest on t | ne unpaid bala | nce at 5.2500 % pe | or year until what you ow |
| Promise to Pay: You pro has been repeid. Collection Costs: You agree to pay all fees. | | • | ion plus interest on t | ne unpaid bala | nce at 5.2500 % pe | or year until what you ow and reasonable attorno VALUE |
| Promise to Pay: You pro has been repaid. Collection Costs: You agree to pay all | costs of co | llecting the amount you o | ion plus interest on the | ne unpaid bala eement inclu | nce at 5.2500 % pe | or year until what you ow and reasonable attorno |
| Promise to Pay: You prohas been repaid. Collection Costs: You agree to pay all fees. SECURITY OFFERED: | Costs of co | llecting the amount you o | ion plus interest on the segrence of the segre | ne unpaid bala eement inclu | nce at 5.2500 % pending court costs a | or year until what you ow and reasonable attorno VALUE 8 |
| Promise to Pay: You promise to Pay: You promise to Pay: You promise to Collection Costs: You agree to pay all fees. SECURITY OFFERED: ISUZU | Costs of co | llecting the amount you o YEAR 1998 | ion plus interest on the segrence of the segre | ne unpaid bala eement inclu | nce at 5.2500 % pending court costs a | or year until what you ow and reasonable attorno VALUE \$ \$ \$ |
| Promise to Pay: You prohas been repaid. Collection Costs: You agree to pay all fees. SECURITY OFFERED: ISUZU OTHER (DESCRIBE) | MODEL TROOPER | YEAR 1998 | ion plus interest on the under this agr I.D. NUMBER JACDJ58X6W791406 SHARES \$ | eement inclu | TYPE | VALUE \$ \$ KEY NO. |

EXHIBIT __

Date

Date

CMNN12 (LASER) 6

(SEAL)

(SEAL)

CREDIT UNION COPY © CUNA MUTUAL INSURANCE SOCIETY, 1980, 82, 84, 86, 89, ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

(SEAL)

Date

Borrower 2 Owner of Collateral (other than a Borrower)

(Continued)

Please look at the box on page 1 to see if this is a fixed or variable rate loan.

The following paragraph applies only to variable rate loans:
PROMISE TO PAY -- You promise to pay to the credit union, the amount you owe under this agreement at an interest rate which will vary as provided on page 1. You promise to pay interest, as provided on page 1, until what you owe has been repaid. The amount you owe under this agreement is the Amount Financed shown in the Truth in Lending Disclosure on page 1, plus any other amounts advanced by the credit union to you or on your behalf under this agreement.

The remaining paragraphs apply to both fixed and variable rate loans: PAYMENTS -- You promise to make payments of the amount and at the time shown in the Truth in Lending Disclosure on page 1 until what you owe has been repeid. You may make larger payments without penalty. If you do prepay part of what you owe, subsequent payments will remain due as scheduled. If you do not make payments as scheduled or if you elect credit insurance, your last payment may be larger than the amount of the other payments, You promise to make payments at the place chosen by the credit union.

LOANS BY MAIL -- If this loan is being made by mail, interest on this loan begins when the loan proceeds are mailed. If this loan refinances an earlier loan, said loan will be cancelled and refinanced as of the date on page 1. SECURITY INTEREST -- Any property shown in the "Security Offered" section will be security for this loan. In addition, you agree this loan is also secured by all the shares and deposits in all your individual and joint accounts with the credit union now and in the future. Shares and deposits in an Individual Ratirement Account and any other account that would lose special tax treatment under state or federal law if given as security are not subject to the security interest you give in your shares and deposits. All property, other than dwellings, that you have given to secure other loans with the credit union will also secure th

Please look at the box on page 1 to see if this is a fixed or variable rate loans:
The following paragraph applies only to variable rate loans:
PROMISE TO PAY — You promise to pay to the credit union, the amount you owe under this agreement at an interest rate which will vary as provided on page 1. You promise to pay interest, as provided on page 1. You promise to pay interest, as provided on page 1. You promise to pay interest, as provided on page 1. Plus any other amounts advanced by the circle into to you or on your behalf under this agreement.
The remaining paragraphs apply to both fixed and variable rate loans:
PAYMENTS — You promise to make payments of the amount and at the time shown in the Truth in Lending Disclosure on page 1 until what you owe has been repaid. The amount you owe under this agreement.
The remaining paragraphs apply to both fixed and variable rate loans:
PAYMENTS — You promise to make payments of the amount and at the same time shown in the Truth in Lending Disclosure on page 1 until what you owe, subsequent payments without penalty. If you do not make payment of the amount and at the other payments in the Truth in Lending Disclosure on page 1. When you are in default if you do not make a payment of the amount and at the other payments is the Amount financed shown in the Truth in Lending Disclosure on page 1. If you doe not make a payment of the amount and at the other payments is the Amount financed and the financed as acceptable of the amount and at the other payments of what you owe, subsequent payments will remain the amount of the associated with the payment of the pay of the pay of the payment of the pa

SECURITY AGREEMENT

In this agreement all references to "credit union" mean the credit union whose name appears on this note and anyone to whom the credit union whose name appears on this note and anyone to whom the credit union assigns the loan. All references to "the loan" mean the loan described in the Truth in Lending Disclosure. All references to "you" mean each person who also this person who

and fees (like registration fees) due on the property and to keep the property insured against loss and damage. The amount and coverage of the property insured must be acceptable to the credit union. You may provide the property insurance through a policy you already have or through a policy

you get and pay for. You promise to make the insurance policy payable to the credit union and to deliver the policy or proof of coverage to the credit

In this agreement all references to "credit union" mean the credit union whose name appears on this note may now to whom the credit union the credit union and to deliver the policy or proof of coverage to the credit whose name appears on this note may not the credit union and to deliver the policy or proof of coverage to the credit signs this agreement. The security agreement in the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to this agreement that the back of the check you credit the property and the property agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to this agreement that the back of the check you credit the property agreement that the back of the check you credit the property agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to this agreement that the back of the check you credit the property agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to this agreement that the back of the check you credit the property agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to this agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the signature area or by signing the statement reterring to the sage agreement that the sage agreement

unenforceable, the other terms will remain in effect.

THE PROPERTY DESCRIPTION IN THE "SEC JRITY OFFERED" SECTION IS PART OF THIS AGREEMENT.

| NOTICE: SIGN THIS AGE | REEMENT ON PAGE 1. |
|--|--|
| FOR TENNESSEE CREDIT UNIONS ONLY USE WHEN AUTOMOBILE IS PURCHASED | FOR NORTH DAKOTA CREDIT UNIONS ONLY APPLIES ONLY WHEN A MOTOR VEHICLE IS PURCHASED |
| NOTICE: If you do not purchase the insurance required on the automobile and the credit union purchases the insurance, the insurance purchased by the credit union will cover only the credit union's interest in the property. The insurance will not be liability insurance. You have read the above statement and acknowledge that the credit union has explained it to you. | NOTICE: THE MOTOR VEHICLE IN THIS TRANSACTION MAY BE SUBJECT TO REPOSSESSION. IF IT IS REPOSSESSED AND SOLD TO SOMEONE ELSE, AND ALL AMOUNTS DUE TO THI SECURED PARTY ARE NOT RECEIVED IN THAT SALE, YOU MAY HAVE TO PAY THE DIFFERENCE. |
| SIGNATURE DATE | FOR CREDIT UNION USE ONLY: Credit Union Approval |
| X | Χ |
| SIGNATURE DATE X | AUTHORIZED CREDIT UNIÓN SIGNATURE |
| CERTIF | FICATE |
| STATE OF | |
| SS. | |
| COUNTY OF | |
| The undersigned notary public certi agreement, executed, and delivered t | ifies that the above and foregoing is a true copy of the original securi by the debtor named therein and to the secured party therein. |
| (SEAL) | |
| My commission expires: Residing in | SECURED PARTY SIGNATURE (If Required) NOTARY PUBLIC |
| (COUNTY) | CREDIT UNION COPY CMNN12 (LASER) 684! |

CITY-COUNTY FEDERAL CREDIT UNION

6010 Earle Brown Drive Brooklyn Center, MN 55430-2506



CREDIT INSURANCE

YOU ELECT THE FOLLOWING INSURANCE COVERAGEIS!

SIGNATURE OF BORROWER ELIGIBLE TO BE INSURED

FELICIA N. BROWN

APP. 821-0786MN

You can protect your financial future by signing up for voluntary credit insurance below. Enroll by simply indicating your preference in the "Credit Insurance Application" section below. Your credit union will be happy to explain the various insurance options and coverage. The cost is reasonable.



P.O. Box 391 • 5910 Mineral Point Road Madison, WI 53701-0391 Phone: 800/937-2644

CREDIT INSURANCE APPLICATION & SCHEDULE

"You" or "Your" means the member and the joint insured (if applicable).

Credit Insurance is voluntary and not required in order to obtain this loan. You may select any insurer of your choice. You can get this insurance only if you check the "yes" box below and sign your name and write in the date. The rate you are charged for the insurance is subject to change. You will receive written notice before any increase goes into effect. You have the right to stop this insurance by notifying your credit union in writing. Your signature below means you agree that:

If you elect insurance, you authorize the credit union to

YES NO

add the charges for insurance to your loan each month

- You are eligible for disability insurance only if you ar working for wages or profit for 25 hours a week c more on the date of any advance. If you are not, the particular advance will not be insured until you return t work. If you are off work because of temporary layof strike or vacation, but soon to resume, you will b considered at work.
- You are eligible for insurance up to the Maximum Ag for Insurance. Insurance will stop when you reach the age.

COVERED MEMBER

SIGNATURE OF JOINT INSURED (CO-BORROWER)
(Only required if JOINT CREDIT LIFE coverage is selected)

| | | CC. 101. 1 | nnoi ili | |
|--|--------------------------|---------------------------------------|------------------|-----------|
| Single Credit Disability | <u> </u> | FELICIA N. | RKOMN | |
| Single Credit Life | x | | | |
| Joint Credit Life | X | | | |
| If you are totally disabled for more than | 14 days, then the disab | ility benefit will begin with the 1st | day of disabili | ty. |
| MEMBER | | INSURANCE MAXIMUMS | DISABILITY | LIFE |
| FELICIA N. BROWN | | MONTHLY TOTAL BENEFIT | \$ 850.00 | |
| ACCOUNT NUMBER | | INSURABLE BALANCE PER LOAN ACCOUNT | \$ 50,000.00 \$ | 50,000 |
| 809005 | | MAXIMUM AGE FOR INSURANCE | 66 | |
| SECONDARY BENEFICIARY (If you desire to name | one) | | | |
| DATE | BORROWER'S DATE OF BIRTH | DATE | CO-BORROWER'S DA | TE OF BIR |
| | 07/04/1979 | | | |

PREMIUM SCHEDULE

© CUNA MUTUAL GROUP, 1980, 82, 84, 86, 89, 98, ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

IMN3L1 (LASER) 27

JRR

MINNESOTA DEPARTMENT OF PUL. SAFETY
DRIVER & VEHICLE SERVICES DIVISION
445 MINNESOTA ST., ST. PAUL, MN 55101
CONFIRMATION OF LIEN PERFECTION - DEBTOR NAME AND ADDRESS

manager of the green steel of the con-

809005-50

First Class U.S. Postage PAID Permit No. 171 St. Paul, MN

BROWN FELICIA NADIR 1830 HAYES ST NE #7 MPLS MN 55418

KPZ205

4WTRO G1260R351 īżņ $_{Year}98$ MACDJ58X6W7914068 SQGM/QGC03

1ST SECURED PARTY

LIEN HOLDER

14 1

RETAIN THIS DOCUMENT - See reverse side of this form for removing this lien.

CITY COUNTY FED CREDIT UNION 6010 EARLE BROWN DR BROOKLYN CENTER MN 55430-2506

UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA

In re:

Case Number 04-43162-RJK

Felicia N. Brown,

Chapter 13 Case

Debtor.

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION OBJECTING TO CONFIRMATION OF PLAN

FACTS

City-County Federal Credit Union ("City-County") holds a secured claim against the debtor pursuant to a note and disclosure statement dated April 4, 2003. As of June 7, 2004, the amount of the claim was \$9,490.82, plus \$1.34 per day interest thereafter. The claim is secured by a 1998 Isuzu Trooper. The debtor has no equity in the collateral.

The debtor states a value for the Trooper of \$6,925.00. The Trooper has an June 2004 base NADA retail book value of \$8,350.00. The same model one year older has an June 2004 base NADA retail book value of \$6,800.00, which represents an average decrease in value of \$129.16 per month. In addition, interest accrues at the contract rate in the amount of \$36.53 each month based upon the NADA retail book value of the collateral. Thus, the amount of \$165.69 equals the initial monthly loss of value in the collateral plus interest on that value. The contract calls for payments in the amount of \$205.00 per month. Payments are owing from March 2004.

The plan of the debtor does not provide any payments to City-County until after the eighth month. City-County objects to the plan on the grounds that (1) the plan is not proposed in good faith and not by any means forbidden by law, (2) the plan fails to make payments to City-

County to provide adequate protection of its interest in the secured collateral, (3) the plan does not meet the requirements of 11 U.S.C. § 1325(a)(5)(B)(ii).

ARGUMENT

Good Faith

The plan is not proposed in good faith because the debtor proposes to use the property of City-County without making any payment during a period of at least eight months, while the value of the property decreases. No guaranty of payment is provided by the plan. A Chapter 13 Plan must be "proposed in good faith and not by any means forbidden by law." 11U.S.C § 1325 (a)(3).

Payment of Secured Claim

The plan is objectionable because it does not provide value to City-County equal to the amount of its secured claim, as required by 11 U.S.C. § 1325(a)(5)(B)(ii). Section 1325(a) of the Code provides that except as provided in subsection (b), relating to trustee or unsecured creditor objections, the Court shall confirm a plan if the plan complies with the provisions of § 1325(a). Section 1325(a)(5) provides that the Court shall confirm a plan if:

- (5) with respect to each allowed secured claim provided for by the plan--
- (A) the holder of such claim has accepted the plan;
- (B)(i) the plan provides that the holder of such claim retain the lien securing such claim; and
- (ii) the value, as of the effective date of the plan, of property to

be distributed under the plan on account of such claim is not less than the allowed amount of such claim; or

(C) the debtor surrenders the property securing such claim to such holder.

In this case, City-County has not accepted the plan. In this case, the plan proposes that City-County will retain its lien on the vehicle, but no payments will be made for at least eight months after the filing of the case. *Compare, In re Green,* 151 B.R. 501 (Bankr. D. Minn. 1993), relating to valuation of the lien. A promise of future payment, even with interest, does not have the actual value of a present payment received or a guaranteed future payment or the present delivery of property securing future payments. The naked promise to pay does not provide actual value.

Under the circumstances, City-County has little recourse but to object to confirmation on the grounds that the plan does not protect City-County's secured interest as required by 11 U.S.C. § 1325(a)(5)(B)(ii). *See, In re Schyma*, 68 B.R. 52, 66 (Bankr. D. Minn. 1985). In order for a plan to be confirmed, the value of the secured creditor's property interest must be protected during the pendency of a Chapter 13 case. Where a secured motor vehicle will decrease in value during the course of a plan with payments to the secured creditor being deferred over objection, the plan may not be confirmed. *In re Johnson*, 63 B.R. 550 (Bankr. D. Colo. 1986).

Although *In re Moses*, 293 B.R. 711 (Bankr. E.D. Mich 2003), may be cited as authority for a one-month delay in the commencement of payments post-confirmation, *the Moses* decision was based upon a decision of the Central District of Illinois Bankruptcy Court, *In re Walters*, 203 B.R. 122 (Bankr. C.D. Ill. 1966), that adequate protection does not apply post-confirmation.

City-County argues here that adequate protection applies from the time of filing and

throughout the duration of the case, particularly when a secured creditor raises an objection. In an Eight Circuit decision involving a Chapter 12 Plan, which has requirements parallel to Chapter 13 plans:

The confirmation requirements of § 1225(a) implicitly embody the concept of adequate protection for a secured creditor's claim. *See also* Farm Bankruptcy Guide ¶ 4.08[2][b], at 4-95 ("debtor's good faith obligation, and perhaps constitutional considerations as well, will require that the creditor's interest in its collateral be protected at all times during the plan repayment period"). The lien retention requirement itself is not met if payments under the plan to reduce the principal amount of the claim will not keep pace with the depreciation of the lien collateral. *In re Borg*, 88 B.R. 288, 292 (Bankr.D.Mont.1988). In addition, the requirement of adequate protection is also contained in § 1225(a)(5)(B)(ii) and § 1225(a)(6), which require that the secured creditor receive payments under the plan at least equal to the present value of its claim and that the debtor will be able to make all those payments. *In re Adam*, 92 B.R. 732, 735 (Bankr.E.D.Mich.1988).

Abbott Bank-Thedford v. Hanna, 912F.2d 945, 951 (8th Cir. 1990).

The better and more authoritative view of plan requirements for secured claim treatment is that the secured creditor is entitled to adequate protection of its secured position from the time that the case is filed and thereafter when an objection is raised by the secured creditor. The plan must provide adequate protection and pay the lien value in order to meet confirmation requirements after objection is made.

CONCLUSION

The plan of the debtor is not proposed "in good faith and not by any means forbidden by law" when the plan projects no payments for at least eight months and provides no guaranty that those payments will ever be received, even though the debtor will continue to use the secured

collateral while it decreases in value. The plan does not make payments to City-County to provide adequate protection of the decrease in value of its secured collateral and pay the creditor the value of its secured lien. Accordingly, confirmation should be denied.

Dated: August 12, 2004.

Respectfully Submitted,

/e/ Lee W. Mosher

Lee W. Mosher Attorney License Number 7570X Davern McLeod & Mosher LLP Suite 150 7500 Olson Memorial Highway Golden Valley, Minnesota 55427-4872 Telephone 763-545-5600 Attorney for City-County Federal Credit Union

04\3\2\250634misomotcop01

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

| STATE OF MINNESOTA |) |
|--------------------|-------|
| |) ss. |
| COUNTY OF HENNEPIN |) |

Melissa M. Peterson of the City of Plymouth, County of Hennepin, State of Minnesota, certifies under penalty of perjury that on August 12, 2004, she served the annexed

- 1. Notice of Hearing and Motion Objecting to Confirmation of Chapter 13 Plan;
- 2. Memorandum in Support of Motion Objecting to Confirmation of Plan;
- 3. Proposed Order Denying Confirmation of Plan; and
- 4. Certificate of Service.

on each person named below by mailing to each of them a copy thereof, enclosed in an envelope, postage prepaid, and by depositing same in the mail at Golden Valley, Minnesota, directed to each person at the address shown below.

Felicia N. Brown Apartment 2 2825 Park Avenue Minneapolis, MN 55407

Robert J. Everhart Attorney at Law 708 Cleveland Avenue Southwest, #101 Post Office Box 120534 New Brighton, MN 55112 Jasmine Z. Keller Chapter 13 Trustee Suite 310 12 South Sixth Street Minneapolis, MN 55402

U.S. Trustee 1015 U.S. Courthouse 300 South Fourth Street Minneapolis, MN 55415

/e/ Melissa M. Peterson

 $04\3\2\51652\cos01.wpd$

UNITED STATES BANKRUPTCY COURT DISTRICT OF MINNESOTA

| In re: | | |
|-----------------|--------------------------------|---|
| Felicia N. Br | rown, | Case Number 04-43162-RJK |
| | Debtor. | Chapter 13 Case |
| | ORDER DENY | 'ING CONFIRMATION OF PLAN |
| The | above case came on before | the Court on August 19, 2004, for hearing on |
| confirmation | and the objection by City- | -County Federal Credit Union to confirmation of the |
| Chapter 13 p | olan of the debtor dated Ap | ril 13, 2004. Lee W. Mosher appeared on behalf of City- |
| County Fede | eral Credit Union. Other ap | opearances were noted on the record. |
| Upor | n the motion and all files, re | ecords and proceedings herein. |
| IT IS | S HEREBY ORDERED, TI | HAT: |
| 1. | Confirmation of the Cha | apter 13 plan dated April 13, 2004, is denied. |
| Dated: | | 004. |
| | | Judge of Bankruptcy Court |
| 04\2\2\2\251652 | doom01 yymd | |

04\3\2\251652odcop01.wpc